

10-1-2014

## This Isn't Your Founding Fathers' Fourth Amendment: Analyzing the Constitutionality of Warrantless Metadata Collection under the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act

Linda Praast

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.cwsl.edu/cwlr>

---

### Recommended Citation

Praast, Linda (2014) "This Isn't Your Founding Fathers' Fourth Amendment: Analyzing the Constitutionality of Warrantless Metadata Collection under the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act," *California Western Law Review*. Vol. 51 : No. 1 , Article 3.

Available at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.cwsl.edu/cwlr/vol51/iss1/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by CWSL Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in California Western Law Review by an authorized editor of CWSL Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact [alm@cwsl.edu](mailto:alm@cwsl.edu).

# HEINONLINE

Citation: 51 Cal. W. L. Rev. i 2014



Content downloaded/printed from  
HeinOnline (<http://heinonline.org>)  
Thu Apr 9 13:55:36 2015

-- Your use of this HeinOnline PDF indicates your acceptance  
of HeinOnline's Terms and Conditions of the license  
agreement available at <http://heinonline.org/HOL/License>

-- The search text of this PDF is generated from  
uncorrected OCR text.

-- To obtain permission to use this article beyond the scope  
of your HeinOnline license, please use:

[https://www.copyright.com/cc/basicSearch.do?  
&operation=go&searchType=0  
&lastSearch=simple&all=on&titleOrStdNo=0008-1639](https://www.copyright.com/cc/basicSearch.do?&operation=go&searchType=0&lastSearch=simple&all=on&titleOrStdNo=0008-1639)

# CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW

**VOLUME 51**

**FALL 2014**

**NUMBER 1**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROFLOWERS DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF INTERNET STUDIES  
NANCY S. KIM  
*Introduction by Thomas D. Barton* ..... 1  
*Acceptance by Nancy S. Kim* ..... 3

## ARTICLES

*THIS ISN'T YOUR FOUNDING FATHERS' FOURTH AMENDMENT:  
ANALYZING THE CONSTITUTIONALITY OF WARRANTLESS METADATA  
COLLECTION UNDER THE FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE ACT*  
*Linda Renee Praast* ..... 7

THE CRUCIAL "CORRUPT INTENT" ELEMENT IN FEDERAL BRIBERY  
LAWS  
*Brennan T. Hughes* ..... 25

THE CONTROVERSY OF CLEMENCY AND INNOCENCE IN AMERICA  
*Sarah Lucy Cooper & Daniel Gough* ..... 55

## COMMENTS

CONCEALED CARRY: CAN *HELLER*'S HANDGUN LEAVE THE HOME?  
*Joseph A. Gonnella* ..... 111

TRADING DEFENDANTS' RIGHTS FOR VICTIMS' RIGHTS: A DUE  
PROCESS RIGHT TO CONFRONTATION AT PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION  
AFTER PROPOSITION 115  
*Micaela De La Cerda* ..... 147



# CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 51

FALL 2014

NUMBER 1

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*Editor in Chief  
Law Review*  
KARA A. RITTER

*Executive Editor  
Law Review*  
SHAUNA C. GÜNER

*Editor in Chief  
International Law Journal*  
JUSTIN A. BEHAVESH

*Executive Lead Articles Editor  
Law Review*  
MALLORY HOLT

*Executive Editor  
International Law Journal*  
ERIN N. BRANDT

*Executive Notes and Comments Editor  
Law Review*  
JOSEPH A. GONNELLA

*Executive Lead Articles Editor  
International Law Journal*  
ROSA I. ACEVEDO

*Executive Director  
Notes and Comments*  
CATHERINE M. ASUNCION

*Executive Notes and Comments Editor  
International Law Journal*  
JOSEPH J. FELBAB

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

KATHERINE R. AUL  
CHRISTIAN W. BARTON  
MICAELA DE LA CERDA  
JORDAN B. DU BOIS  
ALECIA A. GORDON  
JOSEPH J. KAGAN  
SHANE T. LAURITZEN

KAITLYNN C. LEIER  
ADAM B. LEVINE  
ASHLEY L. MATA  
RACHEL E. MOFFITT  
MARY NAOOM  
CHIHARU G. SEKINO  
JAMIE L. SPRENGER

SEBASTIAN L. SWAIN-GIL  
TONYA A. TIMMERSMAN  
MERRICK A. WADSWORTH  
LIANLIAN WU

## ASSOCIATE WRITERS

SABIRA ABDULHAMEED  
ALLAN F. ACEVEDO  
SARAH C. ALVY  
FATIMA G. BRIZUELA  
THOMAS S. BUNNELL  
SHOSHUEN CHIU  
KATHERINE G. COLLINS  
JESSE A. COLLMANN  
ELISE M. CZELUSNIAK  
BRADEN A. DRAKE

THOMAS F. FEERICK  
SEVE J. GONZALES  
MORGAN J. GOOD  
YOKO KONNO  
ERIN L. LAMONTAGNE  
VERONICA E. MCKNIGHT  
PATRICK MCMANUS  
LORENZO G. MORALES  
MICHELLE A. PATRONI  
ALEXANDER D. PEREZ

JOELLE B. RYU  
NICHOLAS C. SABATELLA  
ELEANOR S. SANO  
SUZANNE L. SCHMIDT  
STUART R. SMITH  
KACY M. THOMPSON

## FACULTY ADVISORS

PROFESSOR ALLISON D. CATO  
PROFESSOR NANCY S. KIM

## PUBLICATION ADMINISTRATOR

LANA L. KIZILARSLAN

©2014 by California Western School of Law. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. ISSN 0008-1639. Cite as 51 CAL. W. L. REV. \_\_ (2014-2015).

The views expressed in the *Review* are those of the authors and are not those of California Western School of Law or the editors.

The *California Western Law Review* is published twice a year by the students at California Western School of Law. An annual subscription is \$20.00 per volume. A foreign subscription is \$25.00. Single issues of our previous and current volumes are available at the *Review*. Please contact the *Review* to determine the price for these issues.

CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW

California Western School of Law

225 Cedar Street San Diego, CA 92101

(619) 525-1477

<http://www.cwsl.edu/journals>

email: [lawreview@cwsl.edu](mailto:lawreview@cwsl.edu)

Subscriptions are automatically renewed unless notice of cancellation is received prior to August 15. All notifications of change of address should include old and new addresses, with zip code.

Volumes one through forty-four are available as single issues or bound from our subscription agent, William S. Hein, 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209. Back issues are also available in image-based format at <http://heinonline.org>. Contact Hein for prices. Microfiche is also available from Hein.

The *Review* honors claims for 3 months after the shipping date for domestic subscribers and 3 months after the shipping date for foreign subscribers.

The *Review* is available on Westlaw, Lexis-Nexis, and HeinOnline.

Citations conform in relevant part to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010).

## PATRONS

### LIFETIME PATRONS

ELLIOT FEUERSTEIN .....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
CHARLES G. JOHNSON.....	<i>Ewing, Johnson &amp; Graves Professional Law Corp. El Centro, California</i>
RENEE F. LAFFER .....	<i>Port Washington, New York</i>
ELVI J. OLESEN .....	<i>Richard I. Singer Law Offices San Diego, California</i>
GEORGE J. OTLOWSKI, JR.....	<i>Perth Amboy, New Jersey</i>

### PATRONS

MR. AND MRS. GEORGE M. BARTLETT .....	<i>Rancho Santa Fe, California</i>
MARC P. BOURET.....	<i>Lafayette, California</i>
JAMES P. CLARK.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
ROBERT N. COHEN.....	<i>Weinstein, Kaplan &amp; Cohen Garden City, New York</i>
STANTON W. DAVIES, II.....	<i>Newport Beach, California</i>
ANGELO G. GARUBO.....	<i>Millington, New Jersey</i>
RONALD P. GOLDMAN.....	<i>Tiburon, California</i>
HONORABLE MICHAEL S. GOODMAN .....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
RUSSELL J. KIRK .....	<i>Ketchum, Idaho</i>
HONORABLE MICHELLE LEAVITT.....	<i>Las Vegas, Nevada</i>
CRAIG R. MCCLELLAN.....	<i>McClellan and Associates San Diego, California</i>
MIKE MCPHERSON.....	<i>Vista, California</i>
DALE J. MONTPELIER .....	<i>Knoxville, Tennessee</i>
RON RESCH.....	<i>Los Angeles, California</i>
MELVIN B. STEIN .....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
JAMES J. WARNER.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
ANDREW H. WILENSKY.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>

## **Board of Trustees**

ROY MORROW BELL  
*Board Chair Emeritus*  
*Senior Counsel*  
*Troutman Sanders*  
*San Diego, California*

GAYLE M. BLATT  
*Partner*  
*Casey Gerry*  
*San Diego, California*

HAN P. CHING  
*General Partner*  
*Aloha Securities & Investment Company*  
*Honolulu, Hawaii*

THE HONORABLE IRMA E. GONZALEZ  
*United States District Court Judge (Retired)*  
*San Diego, California*

KENNETH L. GREENMAN, JR.  
*Board Chair Emeritus*  
*Senior Partner*  
*Greenman, Lacy, Klein, O'Harra & Heffron*  
*Oceanside, California*

THE HONORABLE JUDITH L. HALLER  
*Justice of the California Court of Appeal,*  
*Fourth District*  
*San Diego, California*

GARY H. HUNT  
*California Strategies*  
*Irvine, California*

JEFFREY ISAACS  
*Of Counsel*  
*Procopio, Cory, Hargreaves & Savitch*  
*San Diego, California*

IMRAN M. JASWAL  
*Tregin Solutions*  
*San Diego, California*



J. RANDALL JONES  
*Partner*  
*Kemp, Jones & Coulthard*  
*Las Vegas, Nevada*

JEFFREY D. LEWIN  
*Chairman of the Board of Trustees*  
*Partner*  
*Sullivan, Hill, Lewin, Rez & Engel*  
*San Diego, California*

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM D. LOWERY  
*U.S. Congress (Retired)*  
*Innovative Federal Strategies, LLC*  
*Washington, D.C.*

MARK P. MANDELL  
*Chief Executive Officer*  
*Square One Development Corporation*  
*La Jolla, California*

NANCY T. MARLIN, PH.D.  
*San Diego State University*  
*San Diego, California*

JEFFREY R. NEWPORT  
*Law Offices of Jeffrey R. Newport*  
*Houston, Texas*

JOHN F. O'BRIEN  
*Dean*  
*New England School of Law*  
*Boston, Massachusetts*

EBERHARD H. RÖHM  
*Duane Morris*  
*San Diego, California*

JANINE A. SARTI  
*Chief Legal Officer*  
*Palomar Health*  
*Escondido, California*

ROBERT K. SCOTT  
*Law Offices of Robert K. Scott*  
*Newport Beach, California*

RAHIL K. SWIGART  
*Higgs, Fletcher, Mack*  
*San Diego, California*

MICHAEL J. WHITTON  
*Managing Partner*  
*Troutman Sanders*  
*San Diego, California*

THE HONORABLE HOWARD B. WIENER  
*Justice of the California Court of Appeal (Retired)*  
*San Diego, California*

CALIFORNIA WESTERN SCHOOL OF LAW  
FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATION 2014-2015

Niels B. Schaumann, J.D., *President and Dean*  
William J. Aceves, M.A., J.D., M.A., LL.M., *Vice Dean, Academic Affairs;*  
*Professor of Law*  
Phyllis Castle Marion, M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Library and Information*  
*Resources; Professor of Law*

FULL-TIME FACULTY

David W. Austin, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Thomas D. Barton, Ph.D., J.D., *Louis & Hermione Brown Professor of Law;*  
*Director, Louis M. Brown Program in Preventive Law; and Coordinator, Na-*  
*tional Center for Preventive Law*  
Michal R. Belknap, M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Justice Earl Warren Professor of Law;*  
*Chair, J.D./Ph.D. Dual Degree Program in History*  
Laurence A. Benner, J.D., *Professor of Law; Managing Director, Criminal Justice*  
*Programs*  
Lisa M. Black, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Robert A. Bohrer, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Janet M. Bowermaster, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Justin P. Brooks, J.D., LL.M., *Executive Director, Institute for Criminal Defense*  
*Advocacy; Professor of Law; Director, LL.M. in Trial Advocacy; and Project*  
*Director, California Innocence Project*  
Arthur W. Campbell, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Allison D. Cato, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Susan A. Channick, J.D., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, Institute of Health*  
*Law Studies*  
Mario G. Conte, M.A., J.D., *Distinguished Practitioner and Special Administrative*  
*Assistant to the Dean*  
James M. Cooper, LL.B., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Mission Development;*  
*Associate Professor; Director, International Studies Program*  
Barbara J. Cox, J.D., *Clara Shortridge Foltz Professor of Law*  
Leslie Culver, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Robert DeKoven, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Michael H. Dessent, J.D., *Professor of Law; Dean Emeritus*  
Scott B. Ehrlich, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Chair, J.D./M.B.A. Dual Degree*  
*Program*  
Floralynn Einesman, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Kathryn F. Fehrman, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Jessica K. Fink, J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Richard J. Finkmore, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Paul J. Gudel, M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Ruth M. Hargrove, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*  
Marilyn J. Ireland, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Andrea L. Johnson, J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, Telecommunications and In-*  
*tellectual Property Law Center*  
Nancy S. Kim, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Kenneth S. Klein, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
William C. Lynch, LL.B., LL.M., LL.D., *Professor of Law*  
Linda H. Morton, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
John E. Noyes, J.D., *Roger J. Traynor Professor of Law*  
Laura M. Padilla, J.D., *Professor of Law*

Joanna K. Sax, J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, Institute of Health Law Studies*  
Jacquelyn H. Slotkin, M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, LL.M. and M.C.L. Programs for Lawyers*  
Glenn C. Smith, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Chair, J.D./Ph.D. Dual Degree Program in Political Science*  
Steven R. Smith, M.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus; Professor of Law*  
Donald J. Smythe, Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law; Law Review/International Law Journal Advisor*  
Jan Stiglitz, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, California Innocence Project*  
Roberta K. Thyfault, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor; Law Review/International Law Journal Advisor*  
Janet Weinstein, J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, Clinical Internship Program; Chair, J.D./M.S.W. Dual Degree Program*  
Mark I. Weinstein, J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Daniel B. Yeager, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Michael Yu, J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*

#### VISITING FACULTY AND OTHER APPOINTMENTS

Timothy M. Casey, J.D., *Professor in Residence; Director, STEPPS Program*  
Robert F. Seibel, J.D., *Visiting Professor, City University of New York School of Law*

#### ADJUNCT FACULTY

William M. Aul, M.B.A., J.D.	Dina Feldman-Scarr, J.D.
Thomas Bahr, J.D.	Valerie Garcia Hong, J.D.
Brandon Baker, J.D.	Erica Gardner, J.D.
Elizabeth Barros, J.D.	Susan Garrett, J.D.
Anne Bautista, J.D.	Richard Gates, J.D.
Duane Bennett, J.D.	Jayshree Gerken, J.D.
Carol Berry, J.D.	Billie Gibson, J.D.
Flavia Berrys, J.D.	Gary Gibson, J.D.
Matthew C. Braner, J.D.	Aisling Gilliland, J.D.
Todd Bulich, J.D.	Jennifer Gilman, J.D.
Kathleen B. Cannon, J.D.	Barbara A. Glennan, J.D., M.L.S.
Elizabeth Carino, J.D.	Joseph Green, J.D.
Christina Cassisa, J.D.	Kristina Hancock, J.D.
Aimee Caso, J.D.	Richard D. Hendlin, J.D.
Kasha Castillo, J.D.	Kurt Hermansen, J.D.
Solomon Chang, J.D.	James F. Holtz, J.D.
Katherine Clark, J.D.	E. James Jeffries, J.D.
Zuzana Colaprete, J.D.	Josh Karton, J.D.
Anthony E. Colombo, Jr., J.D.	Ian Kipnes, J.D.
Jason Conge, J.D.	Shannon Kitten, J.D.
Maria Dersey Conroy, J.D.	Dennis Klein, J.D.
Coleen Cusack, J.D.	Don S. Kovacic, J.D.
Daniel Dawes, J.D.	Michele Kumaus, J.D.
Tracy De Soto, J.D.	Laura Lamb, J.D.
Deborah Dixon, J.D.	Daniel G. Lamborn, J.D.
William E. Dysart, J.D.	Drew Lautemann, J.D.
James K. Eckmann, J.D., LL.B.	Christopher M. Lawson, J.D.

Clarice J. Letizia, J.D.  
Yvette Lopez-Cooper, J.D.  
Jan Maiden, J.D.  
Brian Maienschein, J.D.  
Tilisha Martin, J.D.  
Peter Mazza, J.D.  
Ramona McCarthy, J.D.  
Jessica McHarrie, J.D.  
Joseph McMullen, J.D.  
Amy L. Moberly, J.D.  
Tomas Morales, J.D.  
John M. Morris, J.D.  
Robin Munro, J.D.  
Art Neill, J.D.  
Ricardo Ochoa, J.D.  
Richard Page, J.D.  
Paul Parisi, J.D.  
Jo Pastore, J.D.  
Stacie Patterson, J.D.  
Brian Pease, J.D.  
Mary Pendleton, J.D.  
Laura Pennelle, J.D.  
Robert P. Pizzuto, J.D.  
Fred Plevin, J.D.  
The Honorable Michael Popkins, J.D.  
Earll Pott, J.D.  
Grant Puleo, J.D.  
Dan Rawlins, J.D.  
Randy Rechs, J.D.  
Gregg F. Relyea, J.D.  
Robert Rexrode, J.D.  
Jeffrey Robin, J.D.  
Stephen R. Robinson, J.D.  
Devon Roepcke, J.D.  
George (Jody) Root Jr., J.D.  
Lee R. Rydalch, J.D.  
Terry Schmidt  
Jeffrey A. Schneider, J.D.  
Dennis Sharp, J.D.  
David Silldorf, J.D.  
Alex Simpson, J.D.  
Dana Sisitsky, J.D.  
Logan D. Smith, J.D.  
Kenneth R. So, J.D.  
Matthew R. Souther, J.D.  
Theresa Stevenson, J.D.  
Gael Strack, J.D.  
Robert F. Teaff, J.D.  
Melissa A. Tralla, J.D.  
The Honorable Robert Trentacosta, J.D.  
Sheila M. Trexler, J.D.  
Vickie E. Turner, J.D.  
Alidad Vakili, J.D.  
Nancy L. Vaughan, J.D.  
Lilia S. Velasquez, J.D.  
Robert A. Waller, Jr., J.D.  
Daniel Watman, J.D.  
Bobbi Ann Weaver, J.D.  
Bradley Weinreb, J.D.  
Lisa Weinreb, J.D.  
Julie Wiley, J.D.

---

#### ADMINISTRATIVE DEPARTMENT HEADS

Lori K. Boyle, MSW, *Director for Alumni Affairs*  
Ruth A. Briscoe, *Clinical Internship Program Administrator*  
Jolie L. Cartier, C.F.M., *Executive Director of Facilities Management*  
Pam Duffy, *Vice President of Finance and Chief Financial Officer*  
Laurie A. Farid, *Executive Assistant to the Vice Dean*  
Susan Garrett Finster, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student and Diversity Services*  
Ruth Goulding, *Director of the Business Office, Controller*  
Pam Hardy, *Director, Marketing & Communications*  
William Healy, J.D., *Director of Development*  
Crystal L. Hengel, *Executive Director of the Swortwood Bookstore*  
Traci Howard, M.A., *Assistant Dean of Admissions*  
Marilyn Jordan, *Executive Assistant to the Dean*  
Bill Kahler, *Director, Financial Aid*  
Lana Kizilarlan, *Publication Administrator, Law Review/International Law Journal*  
Courtney Miklusak, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Career and Professional Development Office*  
Mary Lou Mitchell, *Executive Director of Information Technology*  
Sandy Moreau, *Registrar*

Marilyn Scheininger, M.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Academic Achievement*  
Joyce Stallworth, *Director, Faculty Support Services*  
Rikki Ueda, J.D., SPHR, *Vice President of Human Resources*