

10-1-2014

This Isn't Your Founding Fathers' Fourth Amendment: Analyzing the Constitutionality of Warrantless Metadata Collection under the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act

Linda Praast

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarlycommons.law.cwsl.edu/cwlr>

Recommended Citation

Praast, Linda (2014) "This Isn't Your Founding Fathers' Fourth Amendment: Analyzing the Constitutionality of Warrantless Metadata Collection under the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act," *California Western Law Review*: Vol. 51: No. 1, Article 3.
Available at: <http://scholarlycommons.law.cwsl.edu/cwlr/vol51/iss1/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by CWSL Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in California Western Law Review by an authorized administrator of CWSL Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact alm@cwsl.edu.

HEINONLINE

Citation: 51 Cal. W. L. Rev. i 2014



Content downloaded/printed from
HeinOnline (<http://heinonline.org>)
Thu Apr 9 13:55:36 2015

-- Your use of this HeinOnline PDF indicates your acceptance of HeinOnline's Terms and Conditions of the license agreement available at <http://heinonline.org/HOL/License>

-- The search text of this PDF is generated from uncorrected OCR text.

-- To obtain permission to use this article beyond the scope of your HeinOnline license, please use:

[https://www.copyright.com/cc/basicSearch.do?
&operation=go&searchType=0
&lastSearch=simple&all=on&titleOrStdNo=0008-1639](https://www.copyright.com/cc/basicSearch.do?&operation=go&searchType=0&lastSearch=simple&all=on&titleOrStdNo=0008-1639)

CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 51

FALL 2014

NUMBER 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROFLOWERS DISTINGUISHED PROFESSOR OF INTERNET STUDIES
NANCY S. KIM
Introduction by Thomas D. Barton 1
Acceptance by Nancy S. Kim 3

ARTICLES

*THIS ISN'T YOUR FOUNDING FATHERS' FOURTH AMENDMENT:
ANALYZING THE CONSTITUTIONALITY OF WARRANTLESS METADATA
COLLECTION UNDER THE FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE ACT*
Linda Renee Praast 7

THE CRUCIAL “CORRUPT INTENT” ELEMENT IN FEDERAL BRIBERY
LAWS
Brennan T. Hughes 25

THE CONTROVERSY OF CLEMENCY AND INNOCENCE IN AMERICA
Sarah Lucy Cooper & Daniel Gough 55

COMMENTS

CONCEALED CARRY: CAN *HELLER*'S HANDGUN LEAVE THE HOME?
Joseph A. Gonnella 111

TRADING DEFENDANTS' RIGHTS FOR VICTIMS' RIGHTS: A DUE
PROCESS RIGHT TO CONFRONTATION AT PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION
AFTER PROPOSITION 115
Micaela De La Cerda 147

CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 51

FALL 2014

NUMBER 1

BOARD OF EDITORS

*Editor in Chief
Law Review*
KARA A. RITTER

*Executive Editor
Law Review*
SHAUNA C. GÜNER

*Editor in Chief
International Law Journal*
JUSTIN A. BEHAVESH

*Executive Lead Articles Editor
Law Review*
MALLORY HOLT

*Executive Editor
International Law Journal*
ERIN N. BRANDT

*Executive Notes and Comments Editor
Law Review*
JOSEPH A. GONNELLA

*Executive Lead Articles Editor
International Law Journal*
ROSA I. ACEVEDO

*Executive Director
Notes and Comments*
CATHERINE M. ASUNCION

*Executive Notes and Comments Editor
International Law Journal*
JOSEPH J. FELBAB

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

KATHERINE R. AUL
CHRISTIAN W. BARTON
MICAELA DE LA CERDA
JORDAN B. DU BOIS
ALECIA A. GORDON
JOSEPH J. KAGAN
SHANE T. LAURITZEN

KAITLYNN C. LEIER
ADAM B. LEVINE
ASHLEY L. MATA
RACHEL E. MOFFITT
MARY NAOOM
CHIHARU G. SEKINO
JAMIE L. SPRENGER

SEBASTIAN L. SWAIN-GIL
TONYA A. TIMMERSMAN
MERRICK A. WADSWORTH
LIANLIAN WU

ASSOCIATE WRITERS

SABIRA ABDULHAMEED
ALLAN F. ACEVEDO
SARAH C. ALVY
FATIMA G. BRIZUELA
THOMAS S. BUNNELL
SHOSHUEN CHIU
KATHERINE G. COLLINS
JESSE A. COLLMANN
ELISE M. CZELUSNIAK
BRADEN A. DRAKE

THOMAS F. FEERICK
SEVE J. GONZALES
MORGAN J. GOOD
YOKO KONNO
ERIN L. LAMONTAGNE
VERONICA E. MCKNIGHT
PATRICK MCMANUS
LORENZO G. MORALES
MICHELLE A. PATRONI
ALEXANDER D. PEREZ

JOELLE B. RYU
NICHOLAS C. SABATELLA
ELEANOR S. SANO
SUZANNE L. SCHMIDT
STUART R. SMITH
KACY M. THOMPSON

FACULTY ADVISORS

PROFESSOR ALLISON D. CATO
PROFESSOR NANCY S. KIM

PUBLICATION ADMINISTRATOR

LANA L. KIZILARSLAN

©2014 by California Western School of Law. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. ISSN 0008-1639. Cite as 51 CAL. W. L. REV. __ (2014-2015).

The views expressed in the *Review* are those of the authors and are not those of California Western School of Law or the editors.

The *California Western Law Review* is published twice a year by the students at California Western School of Law. An annual subscription is \$20.00 per volume. A foreign subscription is \$25.00. Single issues of our previous and current volumes are available at the *Review*. Please contact the *Review* to determine the price for these issues.

CALIFORNIA WESTERN LAW REVIEW
California Western School of Law
225 Cedar Street San Diego, CA 92101
(619) 525-1477
<http://www.cwsl.edu/journals>
email: lawreview@cwsl.edu

Subscriptions are automatically renewed unless notice of cancellation is received prior to August 15. All notifications of change of address should include old and new addresses, with zip code.

Volumes one through forty-four are available as single issues or bound from our subscription agent, William S. Hein, 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209. Back issues are also available in image-based format at <http://heinonline.org>. Contact Hein for prices. Microfiche is also available from Hein.

The *Review* honors claims for 3 months after the shipping date for domestic subscribers and 3 months after the shipping date for foreign subscribers.

The *Review* is available on Westlaw, Lexis-Nexis, and HeinOnline.

Citations conform in relevant part to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010).

PATRONS

LIFETIME PATRONS

ELLIOT FEUERSTEIN	<i>San Diego, California</i>
CHARLES G. JOHNSON.....	<i>Ewing, Johnson & Graves Professional Law Corp. El Centro, California</i>
RENEE F. LAFFER	<i>Port Washington, New York</i>
ELVI J. OLESEN	<i>Richard I. Singer Law Offices San Diego, California</i>
GEORGE J. OTLOWSKI, JR.....	<i>Perth Amboy, New Jersey</i>

PATRONS

MR. AND MRS. GEORGE M. BARTLETT	<i>Rancho Santa Fe, California</i>
MARC P. BOURET.....	<i>Lafayette, California</i>
JAMES P. CLARK.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
ROBERT N. COHEN.....	<i>Weinstein, Kaplan & Cohen Garden City, New York</i>
STANTON W. DAVIES, II.....	<i>Newport Beach, California</i>
ANGELO G. GARUBO.....	<i>Millington, New Jersey</i>
RONALD P. GOLDMAN.....	<i>Tiburon, California</i>
HONORABLE MICHAEL S. GOODMAN	<i>San Diego, California</i>
RUSSELL J. KIRK	<i>Ketchum, Idaho</i>
HONORABLE MICHELLE LEAVITT.....	<i>Las Vegas, Nevada</i>
CRAIG R. MCCLELLAN.....	<i>McClellan and Associates San Diego, California</i>
MIKE MCPHERSON.....	<i>Vista, California</i>
DALE J. MONTPELIER	<i>Knoxville, Tennessee</i>
RON RESCH.....	<i>Los Angeles, California</i>
MELVIN B. STEIN	<i>San Diego, California</i>
JAMES J. WARNER.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>
ANDREW H. WILENSKY.....	<i>San Diego, California</i>

Board of Trustees

ROY MORROW BELL
Board Chair Emeritus
Senior Counsel
Troutman Sanders
San Diego, California

GAYLE M. BLATT
Partner
Casey Gerry
San Diego, California

HAN P. CHING
General Partner
Aloha Securities & Investment Company
Honolulu, Hawaii

THE HONORABLE IRMA E. GONZALEZ
United States District Court Judge (Retired)
San Diego, California

KENNETH L. GREENMAN, JR.
Board Chair Emeritus
Senior Partner
Greenman, Lacy, Klein, O'Harra & Heffron
Oceanside, California

THE HONORABLE JUDITH L. HALLER
Justice of the California Court of Appeal,
Fourth District
San Diego, California

GARY H. HUNT
California Strategies
Irvine, California

JEFFREY ISAACS
Of Counsel
Procopio, Cory, Hargreaves & Savitch
San Diego, California

IMRAN M. JASWAL
Tregin Solutions
San Diego, California

J. RANDALL JONES
Partner
Kemp, Jones & Coulthard
Las Vegas, Nevada

JEFFREY D. LEWIN
Chairman of the Board of Trustees
Partner
Sullivan, Hill, Lewin, Rez & Engel
San Diego, California

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM D. LOWERY
U.S. Congress (Retired)
Innovative Federal Strategies, LLC
Washington, D.C.

MARK P. MANDELL
Chief Executive Officer
Square One Development Corporation
La Jolla, California

NANCY T. MARLIN, PH.D.
San Diego State University
San Diego, California

JEFFREY R. NEWPORT
Law Offices of Jeffrey R. Newport
Houston, Texas

JOHN F. O'BRIEN
Dean
New England School of Law
Boston, Massachusetts

EBERHARD H. RÖHM
Duane Morris
San Diego, California

JANINE A. SARTI
Chief Legal Officer
Palomar Health
Escondido, California

ROBERT K. SCOTT
Law Offices of Robert K. Scott
Newport Beach, California

RAHIL K. SWIGART
Higgs, Fletcher, Mack
San Diego, California

MICHAEL J. WHITTON
Managing Partner
Troutman Sanders
San Diego, California

THE HONORABLE HOWARD B. WIENER
Justice of the California Court of Appeal (Retired)
San Diego, California

CALIFORNIA WESTERN SCHOOL OF LAW
FACULTY AND ADMINISTRATION 2014-2015

Niels B. Schaumann, J.D., *President and Dean*
William J. Aceves, M.A., J.D., M.A., LL.M., *Vice Dean, Academic Affairs;*
Professor of Law
Phyllis Castle Marion, M.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Library and Information*
Resources; Professor of Law

FULL-TIME FACULTY

David W. Austin, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Thomas D. Barton, Ph.D., J.D., *Louis & Hermione Brown Professor of Law;*
Director, Louis M. Brown Program in Preventive Law; and Coordinator, Na-
tional Center for Preventive Law
Michal R. Belknap, M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Justice Earl Warren Professor of Law;*
Chair, J.D./Ph.D. Dual Degree Program in History
Laurence A. Benner, J.D., *Professor of Law; Managing Director, Criminal Justice*
Programs
Lisa M. Black, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Robert A. Bohrer, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Janet M. Bowermaster, J.D., *Professor of Law*
Justin P. Brooks, J.D., LL.M., *Executive Director, Institute for Criminal Defense*
Advocacy; Professor of Law; Director, LL.M. in Trial Advocacy; and Project
Director, California Innocence Project
Arthur W. Campbell, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Allison D. Cato, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Susan A. Channick, J.D., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, Institute of Health*
Law Studies
Mario G. Conte, M.A., J.D., *Distinguished Practitioner and Special Administrative*
Assistant to the Dean
James M. Cooper, LL.B., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Mission Development;*
Associate Professor; Director, International Studies Program
Barbara J. Cox, J.D., *Clara Shortridge Foltz Professor of Law*
Leslie Culver, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Robert DeKoven, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Michael H. Dessent, J.D., *Professor of Law; Dean Emeritus*
Scott B. Ehrlich, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Chair, J.D./M.B.A. Dual Degree*
Program
Floralynn Einesman, J.D., *Professor of Law*
Kathryn F. Fehrman, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Jessica K. Fink, J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
Richard J. Finkmore, J.D., *Professor of Law*
Paul J. Gudel, M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
Ruth M. Hargrove, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor*
Marilyn J. Ireland, J.D., *Professor of Law*
Andrea L. Johnson, J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, Telecommunications and In-*
tellectual Property Law Center
Nancy S. Kim, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Kenneth S. Klein, J.D., *Professor of Law*
William C. Lynch, LL.B., LL.M., LL.D., *Professor of Law*
Linda H. Morton, J.D., *Professor of Law*
John E. Noyes, J.D., *Roger J. Traynor Professor of Law*
Laura M. Padilla, J.D., *Professor of Law*

Joanna K. Sax, J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, Institute of Health Law Studies*
Jacquelyn H. Slotkin, M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, LL.M. and M.C.L. Programs for Lawyers*
Glenn C. Smith, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Chair, J.D./Ph.D. Dual Degree Program in Political Science*
Steven R. Smith, M.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus; Professor of Law*
Donald J. Smythe, Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law; Law Review/International Law Journal Advisor*
Jan Stiglitz, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law; Co-Director, California Innocence Project*
Robert K. Thyfault, J.D., *Legal Writing Professor; Law Review/International Law Journal Advisor*
Janet Weinstein, J.D., *Professor of Law; Director, Clinical Internship Program; Chair, J.D./M.S.W. Dual Degree Program*
Mark I. Weinstein, J.D., *Professor of Law*
Daniel B. Yeager, J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
Michael Yu, J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*

VISITING FACULTY AND OTHER APPOINTMENTS

Timothy M. Casey, J.D., *Professor in Residence; Director, STEPPS Program*
Robert F. Seibel, J.D., *Visiting Professor, City University of New York School of Law*

ADJUNCT FACULTY

William M. Aul, M.B.A., J.D.	Dina Feldman-Scarr, J.D.
Thomas Bahr, J.D.	Valerie Garcia Hong, J.D.
Brandon Baker, J.D.	Erica Gardner, J.D.
Elizabeth Barros, J.D.	Susan Garrett, J.D.
Anne Bautista, J.D.	Richard Gates, J.D.
Duane Bennett, J.D.	Jayshree Gerken, J.D.
Carol Berry, J.D.	Billie Gibson, J.D.
Flavia Berrys, J.D.	Gary Gibson, J.D.
Matthew C. Braner, J.D.	Aisling Gilliland, J.D.
Todd Bulich, J.D.	Jennifer Gilman, J.D.
Kathleen B. Cannon, J.D.	Barbara A. Glennan, J.D., M.L.S.
Elizabeth Carino, J.D.	Joseph Green, J.D.
Christina Cassisa, J.D.	Kristina Hancock, J.D.
Aimee Caso, J.D.	Richard D. Hendlin, J.D.
Kasha Castillo, J.D.	Kurt Hermansen, J.D.
Solomon Chang, J.D.	James F. Holtz, J.D.
Katherine Clark, J.D.	E. James Jeffries, J.D.
Zuzana Colaprete, J.D.	Josh Karton, J.D.
Anthony E. Colombo, Jr., J.D.	Ian Kipnes, J.D.
Jason Conge, J.D.	Shannon Kitten, J.D.
Maria Dersey Conroy, J.D.	Dennis Klein, J.D.
Coleen Cusack, J.D.	Don S. Kovacic, J.D.
Daniel Dawes, J.D.	Michele Kumaus, J.D.
Tracy De Soto, J.D.	Laura Lamb, J.D.
Deborah Dixon, J.D.	Daniel G. Lamborn, J.D.
William E. Dysart, J.D.	Drew Lautemann, J.D.
James K. Eckmann, J.D., LL.B.	Christopher M. Lawson, J.D.

Clarice J. Letizia, J.D.
Yvette Lopez-Cooper, J.D.
Jan Maiden, J.D.
Brian Maienschein, J.D.
Tilisha Martin, J.D.
Peter Mazza, J.D.
Ramona McCarthy, J.D.
Jessica McHarrie, J.D.
Joseph McMullen, J.D.
Amy L. Moberly, J.D.
Tomas Morales, J.D.
John M. Morris, J.D.
Robin Munro, J.D.
Art Neill, J.D.
Ricardo Ochoa, J.D.
Richard Page, J.D.
Paul Parisi, J.D.
Jo Pastore, J.D.
Stacie Patterson, J.D.
Brian Pease, J.D.
Mary Pendleton, J.D.
Laura Pennelle, J.D.
Robert P. Pizzuto, J.D.
Fred Plevin, J.D.
The Honorable Michael Popkins, J.D.
Earll Pott, J.D.
Grant Puleo, J.D.
Dan Rawlins, J.D.
Randy Rechs, J.D.
Gregg F. Relyea, J.D.
Robert Rexrode, J.D.
Jeffrey Robin, J.D.
Stephen R. Robinson, J.D.
Devon Roepcke, J.D.
George (Jody) Root Jr., J.D.
Lee R. Rydalch, J.D.
Terry Schmidt
Jeffrey A. Schneider, J.D.
Dennis Sharp, J.D.
David Silldorf, J.D.
Alex Simpson, J.D.
Dana Sisitsky, J.D.
Logan D. Smith, J.D.
Kenneth R. So, J.D.
Matthew R. Souther, J.D.
Theresa Stevenson, J.D.
Gael Strack, J.D.
Robert F. Teaff, J.D.
Melissa A. Tralla, J.D.
The Honorable Robert Trentacosta, J.D.
Sheila M. Trexler, J.D.
Vickie E. Turner, J.D.
Alidad Vakili, J.D.
Nancy L. Vaughan, J.D.
Lilia S. Velasquez, J.D.
Robert A. Waller, Jr., J.D.
Daniel Watman, J.D.
Bobbi Ann Weaver, J.D.
Bradley Weinreb, J.D.
Lisa Weinreb, J.D.
Julie Wiley, J.D.

ADMINISTRATIVE DEPARTMENT HEADS

Lori K. Boyle, MSW, *Director for Alumni Affairs*
Ruth A. Briscoe, *Clinical Internship Program Administrator*
Jolie L. Cartier, C.F.M., *Executive Director of Facilities Management*
Pam Duffy, *Vice President of Finance and Chief Financial Officer*
Laurie A. Farid, *Executive Assistant to the Vice Dean*
Susan Garrett Finster, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student and Diversity Services*
Ruth Goulding, *Director of the Business Office, Controller*
Pam Hardy, *Director, Marketing & Communications*
William Healy, J.D., *Director of Development*
Crystal L. Hengel, *Executive Director of the Swortwood Bookstore*
Traci Howard, M.A., *Assistant Dean of Admissions*
Marilyn Jordan, *Executive Assistant to the Dean*
Bill Kahler, *Director, Financial Aid*
Lana Kizilarlan, *Publication Administrator, Law Review/International Law Journal*
Courtney Miklusak, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Career and Professional Development Office*
Mary Lou Mitchell, *Executive Director of Information Technology*
Sandy Moreau, *Registrar*

Marilyn Scheininger, M.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Academic Achievement*
Joyce Stallworth, *Director, Faculty Support Services*
Rikki Ueda, J.D., SPHR, *Vice President of Human Resources*